arXiv:1409.1614v1 [math.CO] 4 Sep 2014

AN ELEMENTARY PROOF OF THE CAYLEY FORMULA USING RANDOM MAPS

STEVEN HAO, ANDREW HE, RAY LI, AND SCOTT WU

Abstract. Cayley's formula states that the number of labelled trees on n vertices is n^{n-2}, and many of the current proofs involve complex structures or rigorous computation[**?**]. We present a bijective proof of the formula by providing an elementary calculation of the probability that a cycle occurs in a random map from an n-element set to an $n+1$-element set.

1. Proof of Cayley's Theorem

Definition 1.1. For a set $S \subset \mathbb{Z}^+$, define an *S-map* to be a map $f : S \to S \cup \{0\}$.

Lemma 1.2. *For any finite, non-empty set S of positive integers, let f be a random S-map such that for all $i \in S$,*

(1) *the $f(i)$ are chosen independently*
(2) *$P[f(i) \neq 0] = p$*
(3) *when $f(i) \neq 0$, $f(i)$ is selected uniformly at random from S.*

Then the probability that f has a cycle is p. (Note that as defined, 0 cannot be in a cycle)

Proof. Let $n = |S|$. We proceed by strong induction on n. A base case is not necessary.

For the sake of induction, assume the statement is true for all sets with size less than n.

Call an element $i \in S$ *good* if $f(i) \neq 0$. Let G be the set of good elements and let $k = |G|$. We claim that for a fixed set G of good elements, f contains a cycle with probability $\frac{k}{n}$.

If $k = n$, then f clearly contains a cycle, so the probability is 1.

If $k = 0$, f clearly does not contain a cycle, so the probability is 0.

In all other cases, k is a positive integer less than n. Now define the G-map $f' : G \to G \cup \{0\}$ induced by f such that $f'(i) = f(i)$ if $f(i) \in G$ and $f'(i) = 0$ otherwise. Note that f has a cycle if and only if f' has a cycle. Note also that the $f'(i)$ are independent, and are chosen uniformly from G when $f'(i) \neq 0$. Furthermore, for every good element i, $f(i) \in G$ with probability $\frac{k}{n}$ so $f'(i) \neq 0$ with probability $\frac{k}{n}$. Thus, by the inductive hypothesis, f', and therefore f, has a cycle with probability $\frac{k}{n}$.

Thus, the probability of a cycle is $\mathbf{E}\left[\frac{|G|}{n}\right]$. However, for all $i \in S$, $P[i \in G] = p$, so f has a cycle with probability p.

□

Corollary 1.3. *The number of cycle-free S-maps is precisely $(n+1)^{n-1}$, where $n = |S|$.*

Proof. Let f be a random S-map, such that the values $f(i)$ are chosen independently and uniformly at random from $S \cup \{0\}$. By Lemma 1.2, the probability that f has a cycle is $\frac{n}{n+1}$, and thus the probability it is cycle-free is $\frac{1}{n+1}$. Furthermore, by construction, each of the $(n+1)^n$ total S-maps are equally likely to be chosen as f. Thus, it follows that the number of cycle-free S-maps is exactly $\frac{1}{n+1}$ of the total number of S-maps, or $(n+1)^{n-1}$.

□

Theorem 1.4. *(Cayley's Formula) For any positive integer n, the number of trees on n labeled vertices is exactly n^{n-2}.*

Proof. If $n = 1$ the proof is trivial. Assume $n \geq 2$.

Let $[n]$ denote the set $\{1, \ldots, n\}$.

By Corollary 1.3 there are n^{n-2} cycle-free $[n]$-maps.

Consider the following mapping from $[n-1]$-maps to graphs on n vertices labeled $0, 1, 2, \ldots, n-1$: the image of an $[n-1]$-map f is the graph with an edge between i and $f(i)$ for each i in $[n-1]$ (possibly with double edges or self loops). We claim this induces a bijection between cycle-free $[n-1]$-maps and trees labeled with $0, 1, 2, \ldots, n-1$: the pre-image of a labeled tree is the map which associates each vertex $i \neq 0$ with the second vertex on the (unique) shortest path from i to 0.

Note that the image of any $[n-1]$-map f is cycle-free if and only if f is cycle-free: if $i, f(i), \ldots, f^k(i)$ is a cycle in f, then the vertices corresponding to those indices will also form a cycle in the image of f. Similarly, if we have a cycle consisting of vertices $v_1, v_2, \ldots, v_n$ in the image of f, then we must either have $f(v_1) = v_2, f(v_2) = v_3 \ldots, f(v_n) = v_1$, or $f(v_2) = v_1, f(v_3) = v_2, \ldots, f(v_1) = v_n$, and in either case, f has a cycle.

It follows that the image of a cycle-free $[n-1]$-map is a tree, as it has $n-1$ edges and is cycle-free. On the other hand, it also follows that the pre-image of a tree is a cycle-free $[n-1]$-map, so this mapping indeed induces a bijection between cycle-free $[n-1]$-maps and trees on n vertices.

It follows that the number of labeled trees on n vertices is equal to the number of cycle-free $[n-1]$-maps, which by Corollary 1.3 is n^{n-2}.

□

2. Generalizations

Lemma 2.1. *Consider a finite, non-empty set S of positive integers with size n. Let π be a probability distribution over S. Let f be a random S-map, such that the values $f(i)$ are independently chosen so that with probability p_i, $f(i)$ is chosen from S according to π, and otherwise $f(i) = 0$, for some $p_i \in [0, 1]$.*

Then, f has a cycle with probability $\sum_{i \in S} p_i \pi(i)$.

In particular, if the $p_i = p$ for all i, then the probability of a cycle is p.

Note that this probability equals the expected number of fixed points of f.

(Note that as defined, 0 cannot be in a cycle)

Proof. We proceed by strong induction on n. A base case is not necessary.

For the sake of induction, assume the statement is true for sets with size less than n.

Call an element i of S *good* if $f(i) \neq 0$. Let G be the set of good elements. Let $k = |G|$. Let $q = P[f(1) \in G | f(1) \neq 0] = \sum_{i \in G} \pi(i)$. We claim that for a fixed set G of good elements, f contains a cycle with probability q.

If $k = n$, the probability is 1.

If $k = 0$, the probability is 0.

Now suppose that $0 < k < n$. Define the G-map f' induced by f such that $f'(i) = f(i)$ if $f(i) \in G$ and $f'(i) = 0$ otherwise. Note that f has a cycle if and only if f' has a cycle. Note that the $f'(i)$ are independent and identically distributed for $i \in G$. Furthermore, for every good element i, $f(i) \in G$ with probability q so $f'(i) \neq 0$ with probability q. Thus, by the inductive hypothesis, f', and therefore f, has a cycle with probability $q = \sum_{i \in G} \pi(i)$.

Note that for all $i \in S$, i is good with probability p_i. Then, by linearity of expectation, the probability of a cycle is $\sum_{i \in S} p_i \pi(i)$ and the induction is complete. □

3. Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Paul Christiano, Yan Zhang, Po-Shen Loh, and others for their guidance.